

REPRESENTATION OF EMOTIONS IN THE TEACHING OF VIRTUES AND VICES: THE AGENCY OF IMAGES IN FIFTEEN-CENTURY FRANCE

Representação das emoções no ensino das virtudes e vícios: a agencia das imagens no século quinze na França

Dafna Nissim, Ph.D.

The Department of the Arts, Eilat Campus, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev

Email: dafnani@post.bgu.ac.il

ORCID: [0000-0002-6850-9087](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6850-9087)

Recebido em: 26/08/2023

Aprovado em: 22/04/2024

Abstract:

This article offers a new approach to discuss the learning of emotions, behavior, and virtues within the context of late medieval aristocratic education. It examines the representation of emotions in the teaching of virtues and vices in fifteenth-century France through an analysis of illustrations of vices in the Morgan Book of Hours and discusses how gestures and movements depicted in these illustrations convey emotions and contribute to moral education. The article also explores the discourse on gestures, emotions, and virtues in didactic treatises and emphasizes the importance of visual representation in moral education during the late Middle Ages. This case study might contribute new methods to the study of the socialization of individuals in past societies where works of art had a pivotal role.

Keywords: Virtues and vices, emotional socialization, late medieval illustration, *De regimine principum*

Resumo:

Este artigo oferece uma nova abordagem para a discussão do aprendizado de emoções, comportamento e virtudes no contexto da educação aristocrática tardo-medieval. É examinada a representação das emoções no ensino das virtudes e vícios na França do século XV a partir de uma análise das ilustrações de vícios no Livro de Horas Morgan e discute-se como gestos e movimentos representados nessas ilustrações comunicam emoções e contribuem à educação moral. O artigo também explora o discurso sobre gestos, emoções e virtudes em tratados didáticos e enfatiza a importância da representação visual na educação moral na Idade Média tardia. Este estudo de caso pode contribuir a novos métodos para o estudo da socialização de indivíduos nas sociedades do passado em que obras de arte tinham um papel fundamental.

Palavras-chave: Vícios e virtudes, socialização emocional, ilustração tardo-medieval, *De regimine principum*

Visual imagery is a good starting point in any attempt to better understand how the nobility was educated in the late Middle Ages.¹ It has been said that texts and works of art are equal partners in horizontal learning: “knowledge transmitted and acquired in a context of informal interactions, to which traditional categories such as ‘teachers’ and ‘disciples’ do not necessarily apply.”² Similar to educators, peers, and any others in a social environment, texts and works of art help construct cognitive and emotional experiences and assist in directing viewers’ behavior toward compliance with prevailing norms. In the cultural ambience of the late Middle Ages, noble patrons were eager to acquire lavishly illustrated manuscripts. Among other tools, teaching the nobility involved didactic texts, which were often accompanied by visual imagery.³

Scholars who study the literature that conveys moral messages (e.g., didactic texts, mirrors for princes, bestiaries, and books of hours) usually discuss the role of moral education in the formation of an aristocratic community. They attempt to discern the values that emerged from the interplay between the religious and secular realms, discuss the rhetoric and the mnemonic training that supported the learning process, and/or define virtues and vices and how knowing them might have fostered an ethical life.⁴ No study has yet addressed the included illustrations from the perspective of the history of emotions in an effort to understand the role of visual representation in that teaching. Yet, passions played an essential role in the discourse on nobles’ embrace of morality. Treatises such as *De regimine principum*⁵ and *Speculum dominarum*,⁶ two well-circulated didactic texts that were used to teach princes and princesses, respectively, how to govern their courts and subjects discuss emotions as an essential element in women’s and men’s psychological world. As gestures were often featured for conveying, among other elements, the emotional state of the imaged figures in the art of the late Middle Ages, the present study examines those figures portrayed movements, how they were supposed to interact with the audience, and the messages that they were meant to deliver.

I take as a case study several illustrations from a book of hours made in Poitiers, ca. 1475 (Morgan Library ms. M 1001, hereafter, Morgan Book of Hours) for a French aristocrat.⁷ Robinet Testard, a French medieval illuminator and painter, who worked for some of the most well-known families of a cadet branch of the House of Valois, illuminated the manuscript. As in similar prayer books created for the laity in the late Middle Ages, the manuscript includes a calendar, the Hours of the Cross, the Hours of

the Virgin, and the Office of the Dead.⁸ It also features an unusual cycle of the Seven Deadly Sins to illustrate the Seven Penitential Psalms.⁹ I argue that exploration of works of art made for a specific audience with tools from the history of emotions field and reception aesthetics can reveal the role of art in the teaching of acceptable expressions of emotion at the courts of late medieval France.¹⁰ First I focus on some of the illustrations in this cycle to reveal how the artist depicted intemperate behavior in these full-page illustrations. Then I discuss the discourse on gestures, emotions, and virtues as articulated in one of the most popular didactic treatises compiled for rulers, the *De regimine principum*. After elucidating the importance of temperance for the “emotional community” of the French nobility,¹¹ I discuss the aesthetic reception of the illustration and the artistic strategies that created a tool for conveying knowledge on the expression of emotions and its link to virtue.

Personifications of virtues and vices are among the most frequently depicted themes in the art of the Middle Ages.¹² Whether carved on church portals or illustrated on parchment,¹³ their role was to visualize a set of ideas regarding the Christian concept of an ethical life. Like other beliefs articulated in artistic media, their formulation corresponded to the contemporary theological agenda and the social norms of the day. In our case, the illustrations of vices accompany seven psalms, which, for the Christian devotee, express the psalmist’s sorrow for having sinned. The artist devoted a full-page illustration to each of the vices. The depictions are divided into two parts. The personifications accompanied by inscriptions are imaged in the upper illustrations as male figures mounted on beasts posed in a decorated interior while the lower registers show groups of people indulging in the sinful activities symbolized at the top.

The illustration of Gluttony shows a figure whose torso arches backward and his limbs create different, even contradictory, vectors directing our attention to the space around him (fig. 1). His left hand holds a ham, as he drinks from a jar, spilling contents over himself. Below, men and women dressed in aristocratic garb are shown sitting at a table laden with various vessels, knives, platters with meats, and loaves of bread. They are reaching for food or drink; the woman on the left is holding the head of a man who is vomiting.

Anger is shaped as a male figure astride a leopard with teeth bared. He is stabbing himself in the chest with a dagger held in right hand as he eats a heart held in left hand

(fig. 2). The bottom depiction shows three groups of figures quarrelling, their fury expressed through strong and expressive motions: a woman raising both hands and turning her head, a man making a fist with his raised left hand, and more. In a similar way, the personification of Wrath is figured in an open posture. His arms are spread and his whole body is somewhat distorted (fol. 97r). In the two illustrations of Anger and Gluttony, the figures reflect inordinate movement, sometimes with the torso and limbs turned in opposite directions out into the space around them.



Fig. 1: Book of Hours, The Morgan Library & Museum, Ms. 1001, fol. 94r (Purchased on the Fellows Fund, 1979).



Fig. 2: Book of Hours, The Morgan Library & Museum, Ms. 1001, fol. 88r (Purchased on the Fellows Fund, 1979).

An examination of gestures in works of art is relevant for the discourse on emotions and virtues and vices because, according to Webster's new *Collegiate Dictionary*, a gesture is "the use of motions of the limbs or body as a means of expression, a movement of the body or limbs that expresses or emphasizes an idea, sentiment, or attitude."¹⁴ The sociologist Marcel Mauss asserted that gestures are not merely physical capabilities but rather are culturally based human phenomena acquired by imitation and learning.¹⁵ A cultural perspective on the subject suggests that bodily movements can convey a nonverbal message to the spectator and even express the emotions of the depicted figure. The movement of the limbs of Gluttony and Anger and their incongruous stances express an unbalanced psychological state influenced by extreme emotions.

The discourse on the link between corporeal gestures and virtues and/or vices emerged in the intellectual settings of the monasteries and the universities.¹⁶ Writing for fellow monks, Bernard of Clairvaux (1091–1153) associated a change in behavior with an inward change when he contended that "the strange movement of the body reveals a new disease in the soul..."¹⁷ In his sermons on the *Song of Songs*, he suggested an additional way to observe the reflection of the inner soul on an individual's body, He maintained that when "the movement of these and other members, and the movement of the sense, gestures and habits, appear serious, pure, modest, totally untouched by extravagance and lasciviousness, rather governed by piety and equality, then the beauty of the soul is manifest..."¹⁸ Schmitt indicates that since the human self in medieval culture was apprehended as a composite of body and soul, gestures had a crucial importance in their ability to "figure a symbolic image of the body in the eyes of God and man."¹⁹ Apart from the notion that gesture is regarded as "the outward (*foris*) physical expression of the inward (*intus*) soul,"²⁰ it was believed that one could enhance one's self to become more virtuous by practicing proper gestures and deportment.²¹

De regimine principum (1280) was one of the most circulated texts in noble French libraries. Compiled by the Augustinian scholar Giles of Rome (ca.1247–1316), who wrote the book for the future Philip IV of France, the text was translated into French in 1282. Members of Capetian and Valois' courts understood the manual's effectiveness as an aid in the construction of their identities and personas as Christian princes. Divided into three volumes, the text offers advice regarding personal conduct, managing a household, and proper governance.²² The division into three books arranges the

information imparted into three delineated spheres – educating the individual on personal conduct (ethics), how to rule the family and the household (economics), and the way a ruler should govern the city and his kingdom (politics). The author, who acquired his theological diploma under Thomas Aquinas at the University of Paris, wrote about various Aristotelian commentaries alongside theological treatises. His profound understanding of classical notions, especially of Aristotle’s work, is embedded in the treatise, with approximately 500 quotations from the latter.²³

Emotions play a central role in *De regimine principum*. The very fact that the author discussed emotions between the chapters on comportment and virtues in the first part of the first book is enlightening. There are references to passions and their proper control in earlier similar compilations from the genre of mirror for princes, though to a lesser extent. Tomas Zahora argues that in comparison to his predecessors, Giles established a more constructed process in which emotions mediate between comportment and virtues. Accordingly, the prince should master the different mores and then turn his attention to the passions, so that his virtues can flourish.²⁴

As I noted earlier, Giles acquired a scholastic education at the University of Paris. Aquinas, his teacher, wrote about emotions, which he labeled passions and affections, in his attempt to provide a comprehensive understanding of human psychology and its moral applications. Aquinas perceived emotions as internal reactions of the appetitive faculty (which includes a sensitive appetite and an intellectual appetite or will) to events, people, or thoughts.²⁵ In the *Summa prima secundae*, he noted that “when the passions are very intense, man loses the use of reason altogether: for many have gone out of their minds through [an] excess of love or anger.”²⁶ Aquinas considered emotions to be neither good nor evil. As argued by Barbara Rosenwein and Robert Miner, among others, Aquinas assigned the passions a significant role in enhancing the power of human cognition and the perfection of human virtues. He found them a central element in the striving for the perfection of human virtue.²⁷

According to Aquinas, man must employ reason as a vehicle for finding the mean between an excess and a deficiency of emotions: “If the passions be taken for any movements of the sensitive appetite, they can be in a virtuous man, insofar as they are subordinate to reason.”²⁸ However, as several scholars have emphasized, it is not an oppressive control. Reason should govern emotions in a way that turns obstacles owing

to the sensitive appetite (where the passions rest), into a “better condition where the passions gladly serve reason.”²⁹ In Aquinas’ view, when governed by reason, the passions can make an essential contribution to the moral goodness of actions. In other words, the result of applying reason to excessive or deficient passions is the flourishing of virtues. Compelling evidence of his perspective on the relationship between passions and virtues appears in different places in the *Prima secundae* and *Secunda secundae*. Alongside the many interesting discussions about how the virtues intersect with passions, Aquinas grouped virtues with the emotions they improve. For example, he classified fortitude with fear and audacity; magnanimity with hope and despair.³⁰ It is apparent that he accepted Aristotle’s definition of virtues as the golden means between two forms of vices, but his innovation was the inclusion of emotions in the moral scheme of human beings.

The author of the *De regimine principum* adhered to a scholastic line of thinking, adapting Aquinas’ core ideas on human morality to the didactic genre of mirror for princes. Unlike the latter’s *Summa*, this text was designed to instruct secular noble rulers, so it had to include information that could fulfill a high noble’s “horizon of expectations,” to employ Jaus’ apt term, in a clear and structured program.³¹ Aristotle’s *Nicomachean Ethics*, *Politics*, and *Rhetoric* were well assimilated into the education of noble rulers in fifteenth-century France; thus, the readers could relate to Giles’ text with their previous knowledge. The framework of the text, which was constructed on core general ideas mined from classical political thinking and the profound erudition of classical sources alongside citations from Scripture and the writings of the Church Fathers, were among the factors that made this compilation an influential source of princely learning.³²

In regard to virtues and vices, temperance was considered one of the most important virtues incumbent upon a noble. It is described with prudence, justice, and courage – before magnificence and truthfulness. Giles opened his chapter on temperance with the statement that the person who maintains and follows the pleasure of the body becomes a bestial creature. He continued with the importance of employing reason to control human desires. He adopted Aquinas’ approach regarding the prominence of reason in the life of the virtuous man, writing: “Therefore, the virtue of temperance motivates the man to follow the delights of the body according to reason and to avoid those [things] that are against reason and apprehension.”³³

Writing, for example, on sociability and the proper enjoyment of pleasure, Giles suggested that his readers demonstrate temperance in their behavior while participating in court entertainments such as jousts and tournaments. After explaining that such events serve as a form of relaxation for rulers but are also among the normal activities of the aristocracy, he framed attending them within the boundaries of the system of virtues: “We say that kings and princes should have the virtue of moderation when they play and fight, and that they should especially exercise temperance when they play and fight for pleasure, so that others will do likewise. [Otherwise,] it seems that they are base, cruel, and violent.”³⁴ The message is clear. A nobleman should enjoy the accepted activities, but he should abide by the virtue of temperance in his behavior, which means that he was not expected to convey feelings of enjoyment or disappointment (depending on his success in the joust or the tournament) with dramatic or vivid expressions.

Another example is Giles’ reference to table manners. In the second book, he dealt with several modes of eating, beginning with a reference to objectional behavior: “The first is to eat very passionately, because such men are gluttons and intemperate, thus such manner damages greatly the soul and harms greatly the body.”³⁵ The comment links passionate eating with an excessively emotional state and the vice of gluttony. It was common knowledge that when hungry, uneducated people would act according to their instincts and grab the meat as soon as it was brought to the table. However, the reason for these rules of eating was not based solely on the wish to differentiate the aristocracy from less distinguished ranks. Giles drew the readers’ attention to the implications of such comportment on the Christian soul. By declaring that “it damages greatly the soul,” he placed the matter in the moral realm and explained why people should practice temperate behavior at table.

In this section Giles, who was an Augustinian Friar, resonated with the standardized behavior of monks, directing his readers to regulate their movement in space. He probably drew on Hugh of St. Victor’s ideas regarding behavior in the refectory.³⁶ Hugh used an ironic voice to describe intemperate behavior:

Let nothing be done with uproar or tumult, but keep all thy limbs disciplined with modesty and tranquillity: not as some do, who are no sooner set down than they show the intemperance of their soul by the unquiet agitation and confusion of their limbs... and with their struggles and indecorous gestures, make a most hideous show of swallowing up the whole feast at one gulp.³⁷

Excitement and desire were not acceptable emotional states, as manifested in that paragraph. Hugh chose several nouns (uproar, tumult, agitation, confusion) and adjectives (indecorous, unquiet, hideous) to describe inappropriate behavior. The word “limbs” appears twice: first in a positive sense, “keep all thy limbs disciplined,” and later negatively, “they show the intemperance of their soul by the unquiet agitation and confusion of their limbs.” In many places in the treatise, Hugh sketched ridiculous comportment, a rhetorical device that amplified emotions like laughter intermingled with fear. No one wanted to be perceived as such a person.

To better understand how artists figured temperance in terms of gestures, I move now to examine sculpted figures of virtues on cathedral portals. These figures, which were carved in stone and sited on the threshold between the city’s secularized and sacred sphere, reflect a contemporary visual articulation of the theme. A set of twelve virtues and vices is depicted in portals of some of the most well-known cathedrals in France. Usually set low and close to the entrance so that visitors could see them clearly, they were sculpted in pairs, the virtues above the vices. In an example from Notre Dame of Amiens, the virtues are rendered as prominent figures, sitting comfortably on a carved bench, their bodies in repose reflecting dignity and calm, and they have shields in their hands. Courage is shaped as a frontal figure holding a shield with the image of a lion in one hand and a sword in the other (fig. 3). Gentleness is depicted in a three-quarter pose, the whole body in a closed position in relation to the space around it with the arms touching the upper torso and the legs together (fig. 4).



Fig. 3: Courage, Notre Dame of Amiens, west facade (image source: the author)



Fig. 4: Courage, Notre Dame of Amiens, west facade (image source: the author)

In contrast to the expressive movement featured in the images of the vices in the Morgan Book of Hours, these two examples of virtues reflect serenity. They are characterized by a relatively closed, serene posture, quite unlike the inordinate movement depicted in the figures of Gluttony and Anger, as well as in other illustrations of vices in that Book of Hours. In contrast to the exaggerated images of the vices, the stability reflected in the portrayals of Courage, Gentleness, and the other virtues conveys a

message of emotional balance. As I noted above, gestures, feelings, and virtues are connected, and that association has an influence on the human self. William of Auvergne, who related to the link between temperance and proper gestures, wrote: “For it is the virtue that moderates one’s gait and the whole motion of the body, and similarly laughter and voice.”³⁸

Another aspect of interest here concerns the visual strategies that the artist employed to address the viewer in a compelling fashion. This perspective draws from the field of reader-response criticism, which was constructed and theorized in the 1960s/1970s in the United States and Germany.³⁹ Historians of medieval art such as Alfred Gell, David Friedberg, Herbert Kessler, and Hans Belting, among others, paved the way toward interpreting and revealing the significance and influence of visual and material products in human life.⁴⁰ I reference Wolfgang Kemp’s theory of reception aesthetics, which explores how a work of art communicates with the viewer. He suggests two ways to explore the communication and interaction between the viewer and the artwork and discerning how the aesthetics stimulates and activates the viewer to take part in the process of interpretation. The first is “conditions of access” – how the work’s location, medium, and size influence the viewer’s interaction. The second is “conditions of appearance” – basically, the artistic strategies, the figures, and how they address the beholder.⁴¹

From the point of view of conditions of access, prayer books established an intimate relationship with their owners and users. The scholarship on books of hours defines several uses. Owners of such manuscripts used them as a vehicle for personal prayer, they could enjoy looking at the illustrations while flipping the pages or studying the relationships between the sacred texts and the paintings. Either way, the interaction with the manuscript was often set in a private space, where the viewer could concentrate and read the content or gaze intently at the visual program.

With this in mind, the forms of address set by the visual imagery benefit from the prolonged gaze of the viewer. In the upper illustration, the artist poses Gluttony’s torso and head in a three-quarter stance with the pelvis and legs in profile. The three-quarter position of the upper part of the body provides the viewer with convenient visual access to the scene. The main figure is a starting point to discover other parts of the central illustration and its details. Another important feature to help the viewer to relate to the

rendering is the use of linear perspective. Drawing on Italian achievements in this field, the artist created an architectural space with a one-point perspective, locating the vanishing point at the eye level of the viewer. The parallel lines of the floor tiles and the edges of the walls vanish at the center of the rendering right behind the figure's abdomen. It is this point in the composition that leads the viewer to reflect on Gluttony's appearance and actions.

A consideration of the spectator was an important issue in late medieval and Renaissance art. Alberti suggested that one should pay attention to figures in visual narrative scenes who tell the audience what is happening. Their gestures might tend to show or hide things, warn about dangers, or invite laughter or tears together.⁴² Gili Shalom traces what she calls "the inviting figure" in Gothic sculpted portals, a depiction that is not part of the sacred narrative, which was introduced into the sculptured event and gazes out toward the beholders.⁴³ In our case, still other features – the use of linear perspective, the positions of the figures, and the setting of the composition, which places spectators in relation to the scene –stimulated their sense of vision and invited them to engage perceptually and emotionally with the illustration.

The lower illustration is a horizontal scene that pictures many figures eating, drinking, or vomiting, and their various motions, gestures, and positions invite the spectator to study them. A comparison between the two portrayals reveals a visual path. An arched frame surrounds the upper illustration, its symmetric composition clearly contrasting with the figure's unrestrained gestures. The viewer might then be led to turn his/her gaze to the lower scene, where the composition is open and the beholder has to imagine the rest of the narrative, which is not depicted. This shifting of the gaze among the various scenes continues with the text. The beginning of the psalm is attached to the upper part of the frame, offering an approach to the text that continues on the next page. Vices and virtues embodied in the human figure in visual art enabled late medieval people not only to differentiate between acceptable and unacceptable behavior but also to acquire that knowledge through understanding the links among emotions, behavior, and virtues. It is clear that the artistic imagery of the vices and virtues in books of hours, objects that had intimate relationships with their users, and on the portals of Gothic cathedrals reflected the scholastic discourse prevailing in that period. The philosophical attitude toward emotions and virtues influenced the education of the ruling elite of France through

didactic theses that were written for aristocratic individuals, who were not only literate but were also able to “read” and interpret visual renderings in the context of the Christian-noble agenda.

In exploring how works of art contributed to the emotional education of their audiences, one must take into account the “emotional community” of individuals who possessed, looked at, and used them. A community of that kind, such as the French high nobility, shared the same values manifested in such texts and imagery. As Paul Binski argues, medieval artworks were not merely illustrations of cultural ideas but were also visual tools that could construct the cognitive, emotional, and sensual human experience.⁴⁴ Exploring such works within an interdisciplinary framework can teach us a lot about the roles they played in the cultivation of an individual’s emotional realm. Moreover, the methodology used here can reveal the central role that emotions played in the formation of values associated with an ethical way of life. Utilizing such a combined method, historians dealing with education, emotions, the formation of identity, and social interactions can offer nuanced histories of past societies.

¹ An earlier version of this article was presented at the International Medieval Congress in Leeds 2021 as part of two sessions I organized under the title “Representations of Temperate/Intemperate Emotions in Visual Art and Literature.” I would like to thank the participants for sharing their ideas and thoughts on the issue.

² Micol Long and Steven Vanderputten, “Introduction,” in *Horizontal Learning in the High Middle Ages: Peer-to-Peer Knowledge Transfer in Religious Communities*, eds. Micol Long, Tjamke Snijders, and Steven Vanderputten (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2019).

³ Aden Kumler, *Translating Truth: Ambitious Images and Religious Knowledge in Late Medieval France and England* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2011).

⁴ The scholarship on this subject is vast. Here I cite only the more recent publications. John B. Friedman, “Dogs in the Identity Formation and Moral Teaching Offered in Some Fifteenth-Century Flemish Manuscript Miniatures,” in *Our Dogs, Our Selves*, eds. Laura D. Gelfand and Sarah Blick, *Art and Material Culture in Medieval and Renaissance Europe 6* (Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2016), 325–62; Orly Amit, “Between Psalter and ‘Mirrors for Princes’: On the Moral and Didactic Messages in BL Cotton MS Domitian A XVII,” in *Blurred Boundaries and Deceptive Dichotomies in Pre-Modern Texts and Images: Culture, Society and Reception*, eds. Dafna Nissim and Vered Tohar (Berlin and Boston: Walter de Gruyter, 2023), 185–204. For studies on didactic texts, see Claudia Wittig, *Prodesse Et Delectare: Case Studies on Didactic Literature in the European Middle Ages/Fallstudien Zur Didaktischen Literatur Des Europäischen Mittelalters*, eds. Norbert Kössinger, vol. 11 (Berlin and Boston: Walter de Gruyter, 2019); Elizabeth Elliott, *Remembering Boethius: Writing Aristocratic Identity in Late Medieval French and English Literatures* (London and New York: Routledge, 2016). Claudia Wittig, *Learning to Be Noble in the Middle Ages: Moral Education in North-Western Europe*, vol. 33, *Disputatio* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2022).

⁵ The Augustinian scholar, Giles of Rome (ca. 1247–1316), wrote the book for the future Philip IV of France. Giles of Rome and Samuel Paul Molenaer, *Li Livres Du Gouvernement Des Rois: A XIIIth Century French Version of Egidio Colonna’s Treatise De ‘regimine Principum* (New York: AMS Press, 1966).

⁶ The Franciscan, Durand of Champagne, compiled the *Speculum dominarum* for Jeanne of Navarre, queen of France (1285–1305). Durand de Champagne, *Speculum dominarum*, ed. Anne Flottès-Dubulle, *Mémoires et documents de l’Ecole des chartes* (Paris: École des chartes, 2018).

⁷ The manuscript has 165 leaves 148 × 108 mm. 38 large miniatures, 20 with border scenes; 1 small miniature and panel borders on nearly every page. <https://www.themorgan.org/manuscript/76937> (last accessed on July 20, 2023).

⁸ For more on the content of books of hours, see Roger S. Wieck, *Time Sanctified: The Book of Hours in Medieval Art and Life* (New York: G. Braziller in association with the Walters Art Gallery, Baltimore, 1988).

⁹ The standard text of such a book and its imagery were flexible and were adapted to the religious needs and personal preferences of its patron. See, e.g., how Valois female patrons and their clerical advisors designed and created prayer books that expressed the women's religious, political, and/or genealogical concerns. Joni M. Hand, *Women, Manuscripts and Identity in Northern Europe, 1350–1550* (Surrey and Burlington: Ashgate, 2013).

¹⁰ Elsewhere I have argued that owing to the essential role granted to material and artistic objects in the life of humans, the exploration of artworks with the suitable methodological tools might also allow for an understanding of the emotional lives of their users. Dafna Nissim, "The Emotional Agency of Fifteenth-Century Devotional Portraits: Self-Identification and Feelings of Pleasure," *Sicilorum Gymnasium: A Journal for the Humanities* 5 (2019): 331–56, 333. See also, Erin Sullivan, "The Role of the Arts in the History of Emotions: Aesthetic Experience and Emotion as Method," *Emotions: History, Culture, Society* 2, no. 1 (2018): 113–31.

¹¹ Coined by the historian Barbara Rosenwein, it is defined as: "groups that share the same or very similar norms and values about emotional behavior and even about feelings themselves." Barbara H. Rosenwein, *Anger: The Conflicted History of an Emotion* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2020), 3. See also her seminal book, Barbara H. Rosenwein, *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2006).

¹² Adolf Katzenellenbogen, *Allegories of the Virtues and Vices in Medieval Art: From Early Christian Times to the Thirteenth Century* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press in association with the Medieval Academy of America, 1989).

¹³ Illuminated manuscripts of the *Romance of the Rose*, a French poem stylized as an allegorical dream vision (ca. 1230), are examples of depictions of vices in a literary text compiled for the enjoyment of the laity. The poem, first written by Guillaume de Lorris around 1230 and expanded by Jean de Meun around 1275 describes a young narrator who finds himself in front of impregnable walls that surround a mysterious garden. On the walls, he sees images of various figures that symbolize Hatred, Treason, Greed, Avarice, Envy, Hypocrisy, and other bad traits. See, e.g., BnF Français 380 fols. 1v–5r. <https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b60003014/f12.planchecontact> (last accessed July 20, 2023).

¹⁴ *Webster's New Collegiate Dictionary* (Springfield, MA: G. & C. Merriam, 1973), 483.

¹⁵ Marcel Mauss, "Techniques of the Body," *Economy and Society* 2 (1973): 70–88, at 75. Mauss stressed the character of corporeal movements/actions as a socio-psycho-physiological assemblage and the roll of education through sociological institutions to retard the disorderly movements.

¹⁶ Jean-Claude Schmitt, "The Ethics of Gesture," in *Fragments for a History of the Human Body*, eds. Michel Feher et al. (New York: Zone, 1990), 2: 129–147, at 136.

¹⁷ The English quotation of St. Bernard's *Liber de gradibus humilitatis et superbiae* is from Schmitt, "The Ethics of Gesture," 137.

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, 138.

¹⁹ Schmitt, "The Rationale of Gestures in the West: Third to Thirteenth Century," in *A Cultural History of Gesture*, eds. Jan Bremmer and Herman Roodenburg, 59–70 (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1991), 67.

²⁰ The italics is in the source. Schmitt, "The Ethics of Gesture," 130.

²¹ The genre of mirror for princes is based on the notion that the ruler can and should shape his manners and gestures in order to encourage the inner virtuous soul. See Zahora, "Since Feeling Is First," 49.

²² Charles F. Briggs, *Giles of Rome's De Regimine Principum: Reading and Writing Politics at Courts and University, c. 1275–c. 1525* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), 12–13; information on manuscripts acquired by Valois patrons can be found in Noelle-Laetitia Perret, *Les traductions françaises du De regimine principum de Gilles de Rome: parcours matériel, culturel, et intellectuel d'un discours sur l'éducation* (Leiden: Brill, 2011), 130–164.

²³ Briggs, *Giles of Rome's De regimine principum*, 9, 11.

²⁴ Tomas Zahora, "Since Feeling Is First: Teaching Royal Ethics through Managing the Emotions in the Late Middle Ages," *Parergon* 31, no. 1 (2014): 47–72, 62.

²⁵ On the passions of the soul in Aquinas theology, see Barbara H. Rosenwein, *Generations of Feeling: A History of Emotions, 600–1700* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015), 146–152.

²⁶ *Summa Theologica*, First Part of the Second Part, question 77, article 2. <https://www.newadvent.org/summa/2077.htm>

²⁷ Robert Miner, *Thomas Aquinas on the Passions: A Study of Summa Theologiae, 1a2ae 22-48* (Cambridge University Press, 2009); Barbara Rosenwein, *Generations of Feeling*; see also Stephen Chanderbhan, “The Shifting Prominence of Emotions in the Moral Philosophy of Thomas Aquinas,” *Diametros*, no. 38 (2013): 62–85. Chanderbhan suggests a more nuanced understanding of the role of emotions in the ultimate flourishing of life.

²⁸ *Summa Theologica*, First Part of the Second Part, question 59, article 2 <https://www.newadvent.org/summa/2059.htm> (last accessed on July 20, 2023).

²⁹ Miner, *Thomas Aquinas on the Passions*, 94.

³⁰ *Summa Theologica*, First Part of the Second Part, I–II 60.4. <https://www.newadvent.org/summa/2060.htm> (last accessed on July 20, 2023); Nicholas E. Lombardo, “Emotions and Psychological Health in Aquinas,” in *Emotions and Health, 1200–1700*, ed. Elena Carrera, vol. 168, Studies in Medieval and Reformation Traditions (Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2013), 19–46.

³¹ Jauss Hans Robert, *Towards an Aesthetic of Reception*, trans. Timothy Bahti (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1982).

³² Briggs, *Giles of Rome’s De Regimine Principum*.

³³ “Donc la vertu d’atempérance fet l’omme ensuivre les deliz du cors selon reson et fuir ceus qui sont contre reson et entendement...” *Li livres du gouvernement des rois* (New York: AMS Press, 1966), 55.

³⁴ “Nos dirrons que les rois et les princes se doivent avoir atempreement en jouer et en esbatre et doivent si atempreement user des deliz qui sont en jouer et en esbatre, que se li autres le fesoient einssi il sembleroit qu’il fussent vileins durs et felons.” *Li livres du gouvernement des rois*, (New York: AMS Press, 1966), 91. I would like to thank Casey (Karen) Casebier for helping me translate this sentence.

³⁵ “La primere si es ten mangier trop ardaument, quer tiele gent sont glouz et desatemprez, por quoi [tele] manière de mangier nuist mult a l’ame et nuist mult au cors...” Samuel Paul Molenaer, *Li livres du gouvernement des rois: A XIIIth Century French Version of Egidio Colonna’s Treatise De regimine principum* (New York: AMS Press, 1966), 208.

³⁶ Clerical writing for monastic or lay erudite audiences drew on his concept and the practical knowledge was conveyed to varied audiences. Stephen Kolsky, “Making and Breaking the Rules: Castiglione’s Cortegiano,” *Renaissance Studies* 11, no. 4 (1997): 358–80.

³⁷ Hugh of St. Victor, *Rules for Novices*, Migne, PL, vol. 176 col. 941. The English version is from: G. G Coulton, *Life in the Middle Ages, Vol. 4: Monks, Friars and Nuns*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1930), 184.

³⁸ William of Auvergne and Roland J. Teske, *On the Virtues: Part One of On the Virtues and Vices*, Mediaeval Philosophical Texts in Translation (Milwaukee, Wis.: Marquette University Press, 2009), 216. <http://site.ebrary.com/id/10375826>.

³⁹ Jauss, *Toward an Aesthetic of Reception*; Stanley Fish, *Is There a Text in the Class? The Authority of Interpretive Communities* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1980); Wolfgang Iser, *The Act of Reading: A Theory of Aesthetic Response* (1976) (Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1980).

⁴⁰ David Freedberg, *The Power of Images: Studies in the History and Theory of Response* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989); Hans Belting, *Likeness and Presence: A History of the Image before the Era of Art* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1994); Alfred Gell, *Art and Agency: An Anthropological Theory* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998); Herbert L. Kessler, *Experiencing Medieval Art: Rethinking the Middle Ages*, 1 (Toronto Buffalo, and London: University of Toronto Press, 2019).

⁴¹ Kemp suggests examining several forms of address by which the painting establishes communication with the viewer. Among several parameters, he suggests that art historians examine the relationship between the figures in the painted scene, the artistic use of perspective, and how they include or exclude the beholder. I employ his method more freely, while taking into account the mode of seeing in late medieval noble courts. Wolfgang Kemp, “The Work of Art and Its Beholder: The Methodology of the Aesthetics of Reception,” in *The Subjects of Art History: Historical Objects in Contemporary Perspective*, eds. Mark A. Cheetham and Michael A. Holly (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 180–96.

⁴² Leon Battista Alberti, *On Painting*, ed. and trans. Rocco Sinisgalli (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), 44–73, especially 63.



⁴³ Gili Shalom, "Reliving the Past in the Present: Martyrdom, Baptism, Coronation, and Participation in the Portal of the Saints at Reims," *Convivium* 4, no. 2 (2017): 96–113; Gili Shalom, "Morality Lesson at the Job-Solomon Portal in Chartres," *Mediaevistik* 31, no. 1 (2018): 89–114.

⁴⁴ Paul Binski, "The English Parish Church and Its Art in the Later Middle Ages: A Review of the Problem," *Studies in Iconography*, no. 20 (1999): 1–25, 18–19.